

# Program absorption operators for nonzero-sum differential games

Yurii Averboukh

Institute of Mathematics and Mechanics UrB RAS,  
Yekaterinburg, Russia  
[ayv@imm.uran.ru](mailto:ayv@imm.uran.ru)

The International Conference on  
on Mathematical Control Theory and Mechanics  
Suzdal, Russia, July 3-7, 2009

# Outline

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

- 1 Preliminaries
- 2 The main result
- 3 Equivalent Formulations
- 4 Comparison with System of HJ Equations Approach
- 5 Example

# Problem

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

$$\dot{x} = f(t, x, u, v), \quad t \in [t_0, \vartheta_0], \quad x \in \mathbb{R}^n, \quad u \in P, \quad v \in Q.$$

- The variable  $u$  denotes a control of the first player.
- The variable  $v$  denotes a control of the second player.
- The first player strives to maximize  $\sigma_1(x(\vartheta_0))$ .
- The second player strives to maximize  $\sigma_2(x(\vartheta_0))$ .

# Conditions

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

- 1  $P$  and  $Q$  are compact sets.
- 2  $f$  is continuous, locally lipschitzian with respect to  $x$ ;  $f$  satisfies the sublinear growth condition with respect to  $x$ .
- 3 Functions  $\sigma_1, \sigma_2$  are continuous.
- 4 The Isaacs condition holds.
- 5 The sets  $\{f(t, x, u, v) : u \in P\}$  are convex for all  $(t, x) \in [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n, v \in Q$ .
- 6 The sets  $\{f(t, x, u, v) : v \in Q\}$  are convex for all  $(t, x) \in [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n, u \in P$ .

*If conditions 4–6 are not fulfilled, one can achieve them by using the slide regimes.*

# Strategies [N.N. Krasovskii, A.I. Subbotin]

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

## Positional Strategies

- Strategy of the *first* player is  $U = (u(t, x, \varepsilon), \beta_1(\varepsilon))$ . Here  $u(t, x, \varepsilon_1)$  is a function of position and precision parameter  $\varepsilon_1$ ,  $\beta_2(\varepsilon)$  is upper bound of fineness of partitions.
- Strategy of the *second* player is  $V = (v(t, x, \varepsilon_2), \beta_2(\varepsilon_2))$ .

## Control formation

- The *first* player chooses partition  $\Delta_1 = \{t'_j\}_{k=0}^m$ ,  $(t'_{j+1} - t'_j) \leq \beta_1(\varepsilon_1)$ .  $u(t) = u(t'_j, x[t'_j], \varepsilon_1)$ ,  $t \in [t'_j, t'_{j+1})$ .
- The *second* player chooses partition  $\Delta_2 = \{t''_k\}_{k=0}^l$ ,  $(t''_{k+1} - t''_k) \leq \beta_2(\varepsilon_2)$ .  $v(t) = v(t''_k, x[t''_k], \varepsilon_2)$ ,  $t \in [t''_k, t''_{k+1})$ .

# Bundles of Motions [Kleimenov, 1993], [N.N. Krasovskii, A.I. Subbotin]

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

- Step-by-step motion  $x[t, t_*, x_*; U, \varepsilon_1, \Delta_1; V, \varepsilon_2, \Delta_2]$ .
- The set of step-by-step motions  $X(t_*, x_*; U, V, \varepsilon_1, \varepsilon_2)$ .
- Consistent motion  $\varepsilon_1 = \varepsilon_2$ .
- The set of consistent step-by-step motions  $X^c(t_*, x_*; U, V, \varepsilon)$ .
- The set of ideal motions  $X(t_*, x_*; U, V)$ .
- The set of consistent ideal motions  $X^c(t_*, x_*; U, V)$ .

The function  $x[\cdot] : [t_*, \vartheta_0] \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $x[t_*] = x_*$ , is called *ideal motion* if there exist  $\{(t_k, x_k)\}$ ,  $\{\varepsilon_1^k\}$ ,  $\{\varepsilon_2^k\}$ ,  $\Delta_1^k$ ,  $\Delta_2^k$  such that  $\text{fineness}(\Delta_i^k) \leq \beta_i(\varepsilon_i^k)$ ,  $\varepsilon_i^k \rightarrow 0$ , as  $k \rightarrow \infty$ , and

$$x[\cdot, t_k, x_k; U, \varepsilon_1^k, \Delta_1^k; V, \varepsilon_2^k, \Delta_2^k] \rightrightarrows x[\cdot], \quad k \rightarrow \infty.$$

# Feedback Nash Equilibrium [Kleimenov, 1993]

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

The pair of strategies  $(U^N, V^N)$  is called Nash equilibrium solution at the position  $(t_*, x_*)$  if the following inequalities hold:

$$\begin{aligned} \max\{\sigma_1(x[\vartheta_0]) : x[\cdot] \in X(t_*, x_*, U, V^N)\} \leq \\ \leq \min\{\sigma_1(x^c[\vartheta_0]) : x^c[\cdot] \in X^c(t_*, x_*, U^N, V^N)\}. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \max\{\sigma_2(x[\vartheta_0]) : x[\cdot] \in X(t_*, x_*, U^N, V)\} \leq \\ \leq \min\{\sigma_2(x^c[\vartheta_0]) : x^c[\cdot] \in X^c(t_*, x_*, U^N, V^N)\}. \end{aligned}$$

# Feedback Nash Equilibrium

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

The pair  $(\sigma_1(x[\vartheta_0]), \sigma_2(x[\vartheta_0]))$  for  $x[\cdot] \in X^c(t_*, x_*; U^N, V^N)$  is called  $N$ -value.

Denote the set of  $N$ -values at the position  $(t_*, x_*)$  by  $\mathcal{N}(t_*, x_*)$ .

*Property* [Kleimenov, 1993]: The set  $\mathcal{N}(t_*, x_*)$  is nonempty. Also the set  $\mathcal{N}(t_*, x_*)$  can contain more than one pair.



# Auxiliary constructions

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

Let  $\mathcal{U}$  denote the set of all measurable function from  $[t_0, \vartheta_0]$  to  $P$ ;  
let  $\mathcal{V}$  denote the set of all measurable function from  $[t_0, \vartheta_0]$  to  $Q$ .

Denote the solution of

$$\dot{x} = f(t, x, u(t), v(t)), \quad x(t_*) = x_*$$

by  $x(\cdot, t_*, x_*, u, v)$ .

We consider elements of  $P$  and  $Q$  as constant controls.

# Programmed absorption operators, [Chentsov, 1975], [Chentsov, 1976]

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

Let  $c(t, x) \in C([t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n)$ .

*Definition.*

$$A_1[c](t, x) \triangleq \max_{u \in P} \max_{\tau \in [t, \vartheta_0]} \min_{v \in \mathcal{V}} c(\tau, x(\tau, t, x, u, v)),$$

$$A_2[c](t, x) \triangleq \max_{v \in Q} \max_{\tau \in [t, \vartheta_0]} \min_{u \in \mathcal{U}} c(\tau, x(\tau, t, x, u, v)).$$

*Auxiliary definition.*

Let  $(t_*, x_*) \in [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n$ . The set of solutions of differential inclusion

$$\dot{x} \in \text{co}\{f(t, x, u, v) : u \in P, v \in Q\}, \quad x(t_*) = x_*$$

denote by  $\text{Sol}(t_*, x_*)$ .

# Theorem 1

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

The set of  $N$ -values at position  $(t_*, x_*)$  is equal to the set  $\{(c_1(t_*, x_*), c_2(t_*, x_*))\}$  where the functions  $c_1(t, x)$  and  $c_2(t, x)$  are continuous and satisfy the following conditions:

$$(C1) \quad c_1(\vartheta_0, \cdot) = \sigma_1(\cdot), \quad c_2(\vartheta_0, \cdot) = \sigma_2(\cdot);$$

$$(C2) \quad A_1[c_1] = c_1; \quad A_2[c_2] = c_2;$$

(C3) there exists  $y[\cdot] \in \text{Sol}(t_*, x_*)$  such that

$$c_1(t, y(t)) = c_1(t_*, x_*), \quad c_2(t, y(t)) = c_2(t_*, x_*) \quad \forall t \in [t_*, \vartheta_0].$$

*Sufficiency.* The penalty strategies are used.

*Necessity.* Let  $(J_1, J_2) \in \mathcal{N}(t_*, x_*)$ .

Put for  $i = 1, 2$

$$c_i^*(t, x) \triangleq \max_{u \in P} \min_{v \in V} \sigma_1(t_*, x(t_*, t, x, u, v)),$$

$$c_i^+(t, x) \triangleq \sup_{u \in \mathcal{U}, v \in \mathcal{V}} \sigma_i(x(\vartheta_0, t, x, u, v)),$$

$$c_i^0(t, x) \triangleq \max\{c_i^*(t, x), \min\{J_i, c_i^+(t, x)\}\}, \quad i = 1, 2,$$

$$c_i^k \triangleq A_i[c_i^{k-1}], \quad i = 1, 2, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}.$$

$$c_i(t, x) \triangleq \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} c_i^k(t, x).$$

*The pair  $(c_1, c_2)$  satisfies the condition (C1)–(C3) at the position  $(t_*, x_*)$ .*

# Equivalent Formulation of Condition (C2)

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

- The function  $c_1$  is *upper minimax (viscosity) solution* of equation

$$\frac{\partial c}{\partial t} + H_1(t, x, \nabla c) = 0.$$

- The function  $c_2$  is *upper minimax (viscosity) solution* of equation

$$\frac{\partial c}{\partial t} + H_2(t, x, \nabla c) = 0.$$

Here the function  $H_1$  is defined by the rule

$$H_1(t, x, s) \triangleq \max_{u \in P} \min_{v \in Q} \langle s, f(t, x, u, v) \rangle,$$

the function  $H_2$  is defined by the rule

$$H_1(t, x, s) \triangleq \max_{v \in Q} \min_{u \in P} \langle s, f(t, x, u, v) \rangle.$$

*The definitions of minimax solution are given in [Subbotin, 1995].*

# Equivalent Formulation of Condition (C3)

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

There exists closed set  $E \subset [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $(t_*, x_*) \in E$ , such that the graph  $\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E)$  is weakly invariant under differential inclusion

$$\begin{pmatrix} \dot{x} \\ \dot{z}_1 \\ \dot{z}_2 \end{pmatrix} \in \mathcal{F}^*(t, x) \triangleq \text{co} \left\{ \begin{pmatrix} f(t, x, u, v) \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} : u \in P, v \in Q \right\}.$$

Here  $\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E)$  denotes the graph of restriction of  $(c_1, c_2)$  on  $E$ .

$$\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E) \triangleq \{(t, x, c_1(t, x), c_2(t, x)) : (t, x) \in E\}.$$

# Equivalent Formulation of Condition (C3)

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

There exists closed set  $E \subset [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $(t_*, x_*) \in E$ , such that for all  $(t, x, z_1, z_2) \in \text{gr}(c_1, c_2)$

$$\left[ \text{co}D_t(\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E))(t, x, z_1, z_2) \right] \cap \mathcal{F}^*(t, x) \neq \emptyset.$$

Here  $D_t(\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E))(t, x, z_1, z_2)$  is right-side derivative of set  $\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E)$  for  $(t, x, z_1, z_2)$  [Guseinov, Subbotin, Ushakov]:

$$D_t(\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E))(t, x, z_1, z_2) = \left\{ (g, \zeta_1, \zeta_2) : (g, \zeta_1, \zeta_2) : \liminf_{\delta \downarrow 0} \frac{d((x + \delta g, z_1 + \delta \zeta_1, z_2 + \delta \zeta_2), \text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E; t))}{\delta} = 0 \right\},$$

$$\text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E; t) \triangleq \{(x, z_1, z_2) : (t, x, z_1, z_2) \in \text{gr}(c_1, c_2; E)\}.$$

# System of HJ Equations [Basar & Olsder]

Let  $\gamma_1, \gamma_2 : [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  satisfy the following conditions

$$\gamma_i(\vartheta_0, \cdot) = \sigma_i(\cdot), \quad i = 1, 2$$

$$\frac{\partial \gamma_i(t, x)}{\partial t} + \left\langle \frac{\partial \gamma_i(t, x)}{\partial x}, f(t, x, \hat{u}(t, x), \hat{v}(t, x)) \right\rangle = 0, \quad i = 1, 2.$$

Here

$$\begin{aligned} \left\langle \frac{\partial \gamma_1(t, x)}{\partial x}, f(t, x, \hat{u}(t, x), \hat{v}(t, x)) \right\rangle &= \\ &= \max_{u \in P} \left\langle \frac{\partial \gamma_1(t, x)}{\partial x}, f(t, x, u, \hat{v}(t, x)) \right\rangle, \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \left\langle \frac{\partial \gamma_2(t, x)}{\partial x}, f(t, x, \hat{u}(t, x), \hat{v}(t, x)) \right\rangle &= \\ &= \max_{v \in P} \left\langle \frac{\partial \gamma_2(t, x)}{\partial x}, f(t, x, \hat{u}(t, x), v) \right\rangle. \end{aligned}$$



# Theorem 2

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

If functions  $\gamma_i$ ,  $i = 1, 2$  are continuously differentiable and provide the solution of system of Hamilton-Jacobi equations then for all  $(t_*, x_*) \in [t_0, \vartheta_0] \times \mathbb{R}^n$  the pair of functions  $(\gamma_1, \gamma_2)$  satisfies the conditions (C1)–(C3).

# Example

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

## *Differential game*

$$t \in [0, 1], u, v \in [-1, 1]$$

$$\begin{cases} \dot{x} &= u \\ \dot{y} &= v. \end{cases}$$

## *Functionals*

$$\sigma_1(x, y) \triangleq -|x - y|, \sigma_2(x, y) \triangleq y.$$

# The fixed point of operator $A_1$

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

Denote by  $c_1^\diamond$  the least function satisfying the conditions  
 $c_1(1, x, y) = \sigma_1(x_*, y_*) = -|x - y|$ ,  $A_1[c_1] = c_1$ .

The Programmed Iterations Method gives that

$$c_1^\diamond = -|x_* - y_*|.$$

Let

$$\begin{aligned} c_1^+(t, x_*, y_*) &\triangleq \\ &\triangleq \max\{\sigma_1(x[1], y[1]) : (x[\cdot], y[\cdot]) \in \text{Sol}(t, x_*, y_*)\} = \\ &= \min\{-|x_* - y_*| + 2(1 - t), 0\}. \end{aligned}$$

The functions

$$c_1^\beta(t, x_*, y_*) = -|x_* - y_*| + \beta(1 - t)$$

for  $\beta \in [0, c_1^+(1, x_*, y_*) - c_1^\diamond(1, x_*, y_*)]$  satisfy the conditions:  
 $c_1^\beta(1, x, y) = \sigma_1(x, y) = -|x - y|$ ,  $A_1[c_1^\beta] = c_1^\beta$ .

# The fixed point of operator $A_1$

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

Conditions  $c_1(1, x_*, y_*) = \sigma_1(x_*, y_*)$  and  $A_1[c_1] = c_1$  imply that  $c_1(t, x_*, y_*) \in [c_1^\diamond(t, x_*, y_*), c_1^+(t, x_*, y_*)]$ .

Moreover

$$\begin{aligned} \{c_1^\beta(t, x_*, y_*) : \beta \in [0, c_1^+(1, x_*, y_*) - c_1^\diamond(1, x_*, y_*)]\} = \\ = [c_1^\diamond(t, x, y), c_1^+(t, x, y)]. \end{aligned}$$

# The fixed point of operator $A_2$

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

Only the function

$$c_2^*(t, x, y) = y_* + (1 - t)$$

satisfies the conditions (C1) and (C2):  $c_2^*(1, x, y) = y$ ,  $A_2[c_2^*] = c_2^*$ .

# The set of $N$ -values

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

**Case  $x_* \leq y_*$ .** If pair  $(c_1, c_2^*)$  satisfies the condition (C3) at the position  $(t, x_*, y_*)$  then one can directly shows that

$$c_1 = -|x_* - y_*|.$$

Therefore,

$$\mathcal{N}(t, x_*, y_*) = \{(-|x_* - y_*|, y_* + (1 - t))\}.$$

**Case  $x_* > y_*$ .** If  $\beta \in [0, c_1^+(1, x_*, y_*) - c_1^\diamond(1, x_*, y_*)]$  then the pair  $(c_1^\beta, c_2)$  satisfies the condition (C3) at the position  $(t, x_*, y_*)$ .

Therefore,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{N}(t, x_*, y_*) = \\ = [-|x_* - y_*|, \min\{0, -|x_* - y_*| + 2(1 - t)\}] \times \{y_* + (1 - t)\}. \end{aligned}$$

# The System of HJ Equations Approach

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

$$\begin{cases} \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial x} u_*(t, x, y) + \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial y} v_*(t, x, y) = 0 \\ \frac{\partial \gamma_2}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial \gamma_2}{\partial x} u_*(t, x, y) + \frac{\partial \gamma_2}{\partial y} v_*(t, x, y) = 0. \end{cases}$$

*Boundary conditions:*  $\gamma_1(1, x, y) = -|x - y|$ ,  $\gamma_2(1, x, y) = y$ .

Here  $u_*(t, x, y)$  and  $v_*(t, x, y)$  satisfy the conditions

$$\frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial x} u_*(t, x, y) = \max_{u \in P} \left[ \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial x} u \right], \quad \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial x} v_*(t, x, y) = \max_{u \in P} \left[ \frac{\partial \gamma_1}{\partial x} v \right].$$

There are no classical solution of this system.

# The System of HJ Equations Approach

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

The minimax (viscosity in sense of Crandall and Lions) solution is unique. It is equal to

$$\gamma_1(t, x, y) = \begin{cases} x - y, & x \leq y, \\ -x + y + 2(1 - t), & x > y, -x + y + 2(1 - t) < 0, \\ 0, & x > y, -x + y + 2(1 - t) \geq 0 \end{cases}$$

$$\gamma_2(t, x, y) = c_2^*(t, x, y) = y + (1 - t).$$

*Property:*

$$\gamma_1(t, x, y) = \max\{J_1 : \exists J_2(J_1, J_2) \in \mathcal{N}(t, x, y)\}.$$



# Bibliography

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh








Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

-  *Krasovskii N.N., Subbotin A.I.* Game-Theoretical Control Problems, New York: Springer, 1988.
-  *Kleimenov A.F.* Nonzero-sum positional differential games. Ekaterinburg. Nauka. 1993 (in Russian).
-  *Chentsov A.G.* On the structure of a game problem of convergence Soviet Math. Dokl., 16 (1975), 1404–1406.
-  *Chentsov A.G.* On a game problem of converging at a given instant time, Math. USSR Sbornic, 28, 3 (1976), 353–376.
-  *Subbotin A.I.* Generalized solutions of first-order PDEs. The dynamical perspective, Systems & Control: Foundations & Applications, Birkhauser, Boston, Ins., Boston MA, 1995.
-  *Guseinov H.G., Subbotin A.I., Ushakov A.I.* Derivatives for multivalued mappings with applications to game-theoretical problems of control// Probl. Contr. Inform. Theory, 14:3 (1985), 155-167.
-  *Basar T., Olsder G.J.* Dynamic Noncooperative Game Theory, Academic Press, London/New York, 1995.

PIM for  
nonzero-sum  
games

Yurii  
Averboukh

Preliminaries

The main  
result

Equivalent  
Formulations

System of HJ  
Equations

Example

THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION